MINUTES

LEGISLATIVE ETHICS BOARD

January 9, 1997
Senate Conference Room 408, Cherberg Building, Olympia, WA


Staff: Tony Cook and Jim Blundell.

Also Present: Rich Heath, Assistant Attorney General; Kit Hawkins, Restaurant Association; Anthony Anton, Restaurant Association.

Mr. Asbury called the meeting to order at 10:05 A.M.

Advisory Opinion 1996 — No. 15. The Board first considered whether, because the event in question in the advisory opinion request had been canceled, the question was moot. Concern was raised that, if the matter was hypothetical, perhaps it was not appropriate for the Board to issue an advisory opinion. Representatives of the requestor, the Restaurant Association, stated that, although the event was canceled, the event would possibly be rescheduled, depending on the Board’s answer to the questions. The Board determined to proceed with the advisory opinion.

The Board considered an advisory opinion drafted by staff. It was moved and seconded that the Board adopt the advisory opinion. The motion carried unanimously.

Advisory Opinion 1997 — No. 1. The Board considered an advisory opinion drafted by staff. It was moved and seconded that the Board adopt the advisory opinion. The Board agreed to minor changes to the opinion and, with those changes, and subject to the Board’s 10-day rule for circulating draft opinions, the Board approved the adoption of the opinion.

Review of Complaint Opinion 1996 — No. 10. In response to a letter from Rep. Appelwick requesting reconsideration of Complaint Opinion 1996 — No. 10, staff explained the Board’s opinion in that case. Rep. Appelwick explained his concerns about the opinion. The Board discussed the extent to which the Ethics Act and the mailing restrictions of Initiative 134 apply to restrict electronic communications by members and staff. The Board concluded that the
analogy of the mailing restrictions and the prohibition on the use of public facilities for campaign purposes do not per se prohibit the passive availability of electronic files, such as web sites, if such files are initially made available prior to the election season. The prohibition does apply to affirmative acts of electronic distribution, such as e-mail and facsimile. It was moved and seconded that the Board issue an advisory opinion on its own motion clarifying the subject matter of that section and directed staff to prepare a draft opinion for the next meeting, in consultation with Senator Long and Representative Appelwick.

**Contract Approval.** The Board received a request to approve a contract pursuant to RCW 42.52.120. The proposed contract is between Terry Wilson, an employee of the Senate, and the House of Representatives. The contract would provide for the use by the House of a computer macro developed by Mr. Wilson in consideration of $5,000. The Board unanimously approved the contract. The Board also considered and approved an agreement between Mr. Wilson and the Legislative Service Center.

**Amendments to RCW 42.17.132.** The Board considered a proposed amendment to the mailing restrictions of RCW 42.17.132 prepared by staff. The Board made several changes to the draft and, by consensus, agreed to present the amendment as an agency request bill.

**Other statutory changes.** The following new legislation and amendments to existing statutes were considered as agency request legislation by the Board:

1. RCW 42.52.380 (restricting political activity of citizen members of Board)
2. New legislation (restricting citizen members from running for office)
3. RCW 42.52.180 (providing an exception to the prohibition on use of public resources for the assistance of ballot propositions for guest editorials)
4. RCW 42.52.180 (adding a deadline for certain political activity during an election year)

The Board unanimously adopted a motion approving the first three of the above four items of proposed legislation as agency requests by the Board. The fourth item was deferred to the next meeting with direction to the staff to work with the vice-chair in developing draft language.

**Staff Reports.** Staff reported that it had received correspondence from the Public Disclosure Commission which was in turn forwarding correspondence from Vern Spatz, Grays Harbor County Auditor, regarding a letter sent by retiring Representative Bob Basich. The letter, on House stationery, contained references to the recent Presidential campaign. Consistent with its practice, staff reported that it had forwarded a complaint form to the recipient of the letter.

Staff called attention to the Executive Ethics Board's Advisory Opinion regarding the Inaugural Ball and the proposed Joint Rules of the House and Senate (Code of Ethics).

Staff reported several instances in which informal staff advice was provided to employees and members.
Public Comment. There were no comments from the public.

The Board determined that its next regular meeting would be held on Thursday, February 13, 1996, at 10 a.m., in Olympia.

The Board entered an executive session to discuss pending complaints and staffing.

The Board reentered its regular session.

Board Staffing. The Board determined, by unanimous vote, that it would select and designate its own staff assigned exclusively to serve the Board.

The meeting was adjourned.

______________________________
William Asbury, Chair         date

Staff: Tony Cook

Others Present: Jim Blundell, House of Representatives Counsel; Milt Doumit, Senate Counsel; Cathy Maynard, House Democratic Caucus Counsel; Harvey Gertson, Dept. of Transportation.

Mr. Bachofner called the meeting to order at 1:10 p.m.

Advisory Opinion 1997 - No. 6 The Board considered a request for an advisory opinion submitted by Senator Jim Horn, who waived confidentiality. The request asks whether it would be an ethics violation to purchase a temporary membership in the Seattle Yacht Club for $10 annual dues. Temporary memberships are available only to selected officials, and provide access to the restaurant and clubhouse facilities, but not moorage. Board members stated that the membership was clearly worth more than the stated $10, using social memberships at golf and country clubs as a comparison. Members also stated that by limiting access to legislators and other officials, the Yacht Club would be extending special privileges. Motion was made/seconded/approved to direct staff to prepare a draft opinion for ten-day circulation stating that the requested conduct would be a violation,
based on the value and the special privileges.

**Role of Board and Legislative Staff.** The subcommittee established at the last meeting (James Andersen and Ruth Schroeder) presented their report. New drafts for the Ethics Board Senior Counsel position description and the “designated ethics advisers” rule change were presented. Motion was made/seconded/approved to adopt the drafts subject to consideration by the absent members. If any of them wish further discussion, the drafts will be held over to the next meeting.

**Staff Reports.** Staff reported on the current status of Board request legislation. Legislation relating to the political and lobbying activities of citizen members of the Board, HB 1241, passed both houses of the Legislature and has been signed by the Governor. The Board’s request legislation on legislator newsletters, SSB 5149, passed the Legislature with some modifications and is awaiting the Governor’s action. The request legislation on guest editorials did not pass. A bill affecting contract approvals, ESHB 2128, passed and is awaiting the Governor’s action.

The Executive Ethics Board acknowledgment of the Board’s referral of the Lieutenant Governor’s letter was noted. Staff was authorized to attend the next meeting of the Executive Ethics Board, which included a comparison of rules on personal use of computers. Staff was encouraged to meetings of the other ethics bodies when their agenda suggests overlap with the Board.

Motion was made/seconded/approved that the Board’s method of approving minutes be changed. Staff is to circulate draft minutes from the prior meeting for approval at the next meeting of the Board.

Board attendance at the Annual Ethics Conference was discussed. Senator Spanel will replace Mr. Aldinger on one of the panels.

Staff also discussed several items involving informal inquiries.

For future meetings in the SeaTac area, staff was directed to seek meeting locations closer to the airport.

**Public Comment.** Harvey Gertson, Dept. of Transportation, commented favorably on the Board’s proposal for “ethics advisers.” These positions would be similar to those used by many executive agencies, including DOT, for liaison with the Executive Ethics Board.
The Board determined that its next regular meeting would be canceled due to the timing of the Ethics Conference. The July and August meetings will be held only if needed.

Motion was made/seconded/approved to adjourn the meeting at 2:15 p.m., subject to the call of the Chair for the next meeting.

Approved by the Board

Will Bachofner, Chair

Date: July 10, 1997

-3-
Members Present: Will Bachofner, chair; Paul Aldinger, Vice-Chair; James Andersen; Rep. Marlin Appelwick; Sen. Jeanine Long; Rep. John Pennington; and Ruth Schroeder.

Staff: Tony Cook

Others Present: Jim Blundell, House of Representatives Counsel; Milt Doumit, Senate Counsel; Cathy Maynard, House Democratic Caucus Counsel; Harvey Gertson, Dept. of Transportation.

Mr. Bachofner called the meeting to order at 10:10 a.m.

Motion was made/seconded/approved to adopt the minutes of the May 8, 1997, meeting as circulated.

Advisory Opinion 1997 - No. 7 The Board considered a request for an advisory opinion submitted by Representative Roger Bush, who waived confidentiality. The request asks whether it would be an ethics violation to contact constituents at their homes and deliver documents prepared at state expense. The request also asks for further explanation of what is and what is not “normal and regular conduct” for legislators. Motion was made and seconded to provide the following in an advisory opinion: (1) use of taxpayer-paid material in such visits creates an appearance of the use of facilities for campaign purposes, and is therefore discouraged even though there are circumstances when it would not be a
constituents to be contacted, the content of the documents distributed, and the timing; and (3) in any case, the such conduct would be a violation after June 30 in a year in which the member was up for election.

The motion passed on a 4 to 3 vote. Staff was directed to draft an opinion for consideration at the next meeting. No action was taken on the question of the meaning of "normal and regular conduct."

Staff Reports.

Staff presented a letter to the Board from Senator Ken Jacobsen, describing the circumstances of a letter he delivered to his local swimming pool association. Motion was made/seconded/approved to send a letter of correction, stating that it is an ethics violation to use staff and legislative letterhead for a personal purpose. Staff was directed to prepare a draft letter for the next meeting.

Board reviewed a newsletter from Representatives Smith and Bush which includes information about a ballot measure. Motion was made/seconded/approved to issue an advisory opinion on the Board's own motion to further clarify and limit indirect appeals to voters on ballot measures.

Board reviewed other informal inquiries.

Board was informed of the proposed luncheon series on integrity and government to be conducted by the House of Representatives. It was suggested that it should be made clear that guest speakers do not necessarily reflect the opinions of the Board.

Board reviewed several examples of an ethics manual. It was decided by consensus not to pursue the matter at this time.

Representatives Pennington and Appelwick, and Mrs. Schroeder, reported on their participation in the Second Annual State Ethics Conference.

The Board determined that its next regular meeting would be August 14 in Olympia.

Motion was made/seconded/approved to adjourn the meeting at 12:45 p.m.
Will Bachofner, Chair

Date approved by the Board: August 14, 1997
Legislative Ethics Board

MINUTES

LEGISLATIVE ETHICS BOARD

August 14, 1997
Conference Room B/C, Cherberg Building, Olympia


Staff: Tony Cook

Others Present: Jim Blundell, House of Representatives Counsel; Mike O'Connell, Secretary of the Senate; Cathy Maynard, House Democratic Caucus Counsel; Harvey Gertson, Dept. of Transportation; and Mindy Chambers, Daily Olympian.

Mr. Bachofner called the meeting to order at 10:10 a.m.

Motion was made/seconded/approved to adopt the minutes of the July 10, 1997, meeting as circulated.

Advisory Opinion 1997 - No. 8. Board reviewed the staff draft opinion, prepared as a Board-initiated opinion request as determined at the July meeting. Following discussion, motion was made/seconded/approved to defer consideration to the next meeting. Staff was directed to prepare a new draft incorporating the members' comments.

Advisory Opinion 1997 - No. 7. The Board reviewed the staff draft opinion. Motion was made and seconded to adopt the draft opinion using "Alternative B", with specified changes, for the response to the second question. Motion was
made to amend the motion to strike out “method restrictions.” Motion to amend failed for lack of a second. Motion was made/seconded/approved to amend by striking paragraph “2. Selection method” on page 4 of the draft, as well as the earlier reference on the same page to “selection method”. Main motion to adopt the draft as changed passed as amended.

Complaint 1997 - No. 1. Board determined that the proper procedure for addressing the Senator Jacobsen letter discussed at the prior meeting was a complaint. Rep. Appelwick recused himself from further consideration of the matter. Motion was made/seconded/approved to accept the proposed stipulation and adopt the complaint and order, with the addition of a reference in the procedural history and the ordering section to the fact that Sen. Jacobsen himself brought the matter to the attention of the Board.

Staff Reports.

Board reviewed informal inquiries.

Board reviewed the progress of the luncheon series on integrity and government to be conducted by the House of Representatives and the Senate.

Chair Bachofner presented Mr. Blundell a certificate for his service on the Board staff, signed by all members of the Board.

The Board determined that its next regular meeting would be October 9 in Olympia. Motion was made/seconded/approved to cancel the September meeting, subject to call of the chair if necessary.

Motion was made/seconded/approved to adjourn the meeting at 12:45 p.m.

Will Bachofner, Chair

Date approved by the Board: 10/9/97
Minutes

Legislative Ethics Board

October 9, 1997
Senate Hearing Room 3, Cherberg Building, Olympia

Members Present: Will Bachofner, Chair; Paul Aldinger; James Andersen; Rep. Marlin Appelwick; William Asbury; Sen. Harriet Spanel; and Ruth Schroeder.

Staff: Tony Cook, Counsel

Also Present: Jim Blundell, House of Representatives Counsel; Milt Doumit, Senate Counsel; Marty Lovinger, Senate Counsel; Cathy Maynard, House Democratic Caucus Counsel; Harvey Gertson, Dept. of Transportation; Ross Baker, AT&T Wireless; Steve Gano, lobbyist representing AT&T Wireless; and Bob Partlow, Daily Olympian.

Mr. Bachofner called the meeting to order at 12:15 P.M.

Appointments. Mr. Andersen announced that he had been re-appointed to a full term, and filed a copy of his oath with the staff. Staff was directed to send a letter of thanks to the Senate Republican Caucus and the Governor for acting promptly to avoid a vacancy in this appointment.

Motion was made/seconded/approved to adopt the minutes of the August 14, 1997, meeting as circulated.

Advisory Opinion 1997 - No. 8 (newsletter ballot language). Board reviewed
the staff draft prepared following the last meeting. Motion was made/seconded/approved to adopt the draft with one change: the word “bill” in the second quotation on page one should be changed to “ballot measure.”

Advisory Opinion 1997 - No. 9 (ballot measure hearings). Board discussed procedure for calling “emergency” meetings. It was agreed that the Chair should decide whether or not to call such a meeting, after consulting other members if feasible.

Members discussed whether it would be appropriate to issue an advisory opinion with hypothetical assumptions, if a complaint is anticipated on a specific set of facts on the same topic. Motion was made to table this item. Motion passed by a vote of 6 to 1, Representative Appelwick dissenting.

Advisory Opinion 1997 - No. 10 (museum reception). Board discussed the application of the gift restrictions to a proposed reception and dinner in connection with special museum nights at the Seattle and Bellevue Art Museums. In each case AT&T is a prime sponsor of the exhibit, and will be having an invitation only evening at the museum. The Bellevue evening also includes a costume ball.

Motion was made/seconded/approved to apply the principles set forth in Advisory Opinion 1996 - No. 15, which makes the reception and dinner exempt from the gift limits under certain conditions, and applies the limit to any subsequent entertainment portion. Staff was directed to prepare a draft opinion for the next meeting.

Staff Reports.
Letter from Rep. Pennington reporting on the COGEL conference in Edmonton was reviewed.

Pursuant to Board Rule 1, the Chief Clerk of the House of Representatives has designated Jim Blundell as the Designated Ethics Adviser; and the Secretary of the Senate named Milt Doumit as a Designated Ethics Adviser for the Senate.

Staff reported on the last meeting of the Executive Ethics Board, which included possible changes to their rule on private use of state resources.

Staff reported on the Public Disclosure Commission’s proposed legislation for 1998. Possible changes to the ethics law should be presented to the
Board at the November meeting.

Public Comment. There were no comments from the public.

Board determined that its next regular meeting would be November 13 in the SeaTac area.

Motion was made/seconded/approved to adjourn the meeting at 2:30 p.m.

Will Bachofner, Chair

Date approved by the Board: 11-13-97
Members Present. All members were present as follows: Will Bachofner, Chair; Paul Aldinger; Rep. Marlin Appelwick; James Andersen; William Asbury; Sen. Jeanine Long; Rep. John Pennington; Ruth Schroeder; and Sen. Harriet Spanel.

Staff: Tony Cook

Designated ethics advisers: Jim Blundell and Milt Doumit

Also Present: Cathy Maynard, Counsel to House Democratic Caucus

Mr. Bachofner called the meeting to order at 1:30 p.m.

Minutes. Motion was made/seconded/approved to adopt the minutes of the October 9, 1997 meeting as circulated.

Advisory Opinion 1997 - No. 10. Board reviewed the staff draft prepared following preliminary decision made at the last meeting. Motion was made/seconded/approved to adopt the draft opinion with one change: "of the dance" inserted between "cost" and "divided" in the next to last paragraph.

Advisory Opinion 1997 - No. 11. Staff informed Board that an opinion request is expected regarding use of legislative facilities in connection with nonprofit organizations.
Advisory Opinion 1997 - No. 9. Motion was made/seconded/approved to remove this item from the table and place it before the Board. Board discussed letter presented by Rep. Appelwick setting forth parameters for permissible committee meetings on ballot measures. Staff was directed to prepare a draft using Rep. Appelwick's letter and Board discussion. Board agreed that the opinion would be applied prospectively only.

Potential legislation. Board discussed possible changes to Chapter 42.52 RCW for the 1998 legislative session. Items discussed were: (1) penalties for false complaints; (2) gift exemption clarification for all educational institutions; (3) amend the prohibition on financial interest in transactions with your agency; (4) clarify the gift attribution to "guests"; and (5) extend confidentiality for complainants.

Motion was made/seconded/approved to direct staff to prepare bill drafts for items (2) and (4), and to prepare a discussion draft for the next meeting on item 3, dealing with at least the threshold issue. Agreed to take no action on items (1) and (5).

Staff Reports. Staff presented a letter from Secretary of the Senate O'Connell naming Marty Lovinger as the second Designated Ethics Adviser for the Senate.

Staff reviewed the proposed changes circulated by the Executive Ethics Board to their personal use rule.

Public Comment. There were no comments from the public.

Advisory Opinion 1997 - No. 10 re-opened. Motion was made/seconded/approved to re-consider Advisory Opinion 1997 - No. 10. Motion to adopt the opinion was passed 8 - 0, with Ms. Schroeder abstaining after disclosing a possible conflict.

Next meeting. The Board determined that their next regular meeting would be held on Thursday, December 11, 1997, at 10 a.m., in Olympia.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:30 p.m.
Legislative
Ethics Board

LEGISLATIVE ETHICS BOARD

December 11, 1997
Senate Hearing Room 3, Cherberg Building, Olympia, WA


Staff: Tony Cook

Designated ethics advisers: Milt Doumit and Marty Lovinger

Also Present: Cathy Maynard, House of Representatives Democratic Caucus Counsel; Harvey Gertson, Dept. of Transportation; Paul Gillie, Chair, Executive Ethics Board; and Rep. Don Carlson.

Mr. Bachofner called the meeting to order at 10:00 A.M.

Minutes. Motion was made/seconded/approved to adopt the minutes of the November 13, 1997, meeting as circulated.

Advisory Opinion 1997 — No. 12. The Board discussed the request for an advisory opinion by Rep. Don Carlson. The inquiry involves application of the mailing restrictions in RCW 42.52.185 to mailings by a statutory committee. The consensus of the Board was that certain committee mailings could be exempt from the mailing restrictions, if the committee approves the letter and if the committee is a joint House/Senate committee with evenly divided bi-partisan membership. Motion was made/seconded/approved directing staff to draft an advisory opinion consistent with the Board's consensus for presentation at the
next meeting of the Board.

**Related issue.** The Board discussed the application of the mailing limits to members who are prevented from filing for office by the term limits law. Staff was directed to prepare an advisory opinion request on the Board’s own motion on this topic for the next meeting.

**Advisory Opinion 1997 - No. 9.** The Board reviewed the staff draft prepared following the preliminary decisions made at the last meeting. Motion was made/seconded/approved (one dissenting vote) to adopt the draft with the following changes: on page 4, second to last paragraph, delete “in an advocacy manner”; page 5, third paragraph, last sentence, delete “which is missing from the question” and insert “for the hearing.”

**Advisory Opinion 1997 - No. 11.** The Board discussed a request for an advisory opinion by Tim Martin, Chief Clerk of the House of Representatives. The question asks the extent to which public facilities, such as staff time, legislative letterhead, and the state telephone network, can be used to participate in or promote the activities of “legislative organizations.”

Motion was made to authorize the Secretary of the Senate and Chief Clerk of the House of Representatives to determine which organizations fall within the concept of official legislative duties. Discussion ensued and the motion was withdrawn.

Motion was made to send a Board letter requesting that the Senate and House of Representatives, through Facilities and Operations and Executive Rules Committees, seek to develop uniform guidelines and report them back to the Board. Motion died for lack of a second.

Motion was made/seconded/approved to decline to answer the opinion request with a letter from the Chair. Staff was directed to draft a letter including the following points:

1. The Board needs to know the full range of organizations and activities which would be affected prior to issuing an opinion on this subject;

2. The Board invites the Chief Clerk or Executive Rules Committee to suggest guidelines on this subject for the Board’s consideration, so that the Board will know what is considered administratively workable by the House;
(3) Provide the Board's informal conclusions on the propriety of the five examples of support activity included with the staff memo. The Board's conclusions are that Examples 1 and 2 seem to be permissible under the broad interpretation of "official duties" so long as they meet budgetary mailing restrictions; Example 3 does not appear to be appropriate at legislative expense because it is a promotional piece aimed at the general public and a personal benefit because the directors of the corporation are all Washington legislators; Example 4 in most cases would not be appropriate, but in some instances it might be, depending on the full context and the nature of the group; and Example 5 in most cases fits within the de minimis exception to Board Rule 3, but the volume of such messages and their connection to legislators and staff are factors to consider.

**Recommended legislation.** The Board reviewed the staff draft of legislation to address the issues of the definition of governmental institutions and attribution of gifts, as discussed in the last meeting. The legislator members agreed to pursue the bill on behalf of the Board.

The Board discussed a request by Representative Cathy Wolfe for comments on her proposed legislative changes regarding the insignificant financial interests of members of state boards and commissions. Consensus of the Board was that it is desirable to have the flexibility to waive de minimis violations of this type; and that a recusal procedure for substantial interests may be needed. Motion was made/seconded/approved to direct staff to prepare a letter for the signature of the Chair reflecting the comments of the Board, without endorsing any specific bill draft language.

**Staff Reports.** Staff reported that informal inquiries had been received and answered in the last month on the topics of use of facilities, mailings, gifts, and conflict of interest. Staff also noted receipt of a request from the U.S. Senate Select Committee on Ethics for the Board's procedural rules.

Staff was directed to prepare a manual or handbook with summaries of the statute and the Board's opinions, for review by the Board.

**Public Comment.** There were no comments from the public.

**Next meeting.** The Board determined that its next regular meeting would be held on Thursday, January 15, 1998, at 11:30 a.m., in Olympia.

The meeting was adjourned at 2:15 p.m.